AHMEDABAD

SCORE  RANK
4.4/10  7/23

▲ 1.1 increase from 2016

TOP INDIAN CITY
Pune | Score: 5.1

KEY REFORMS

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)

2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)

3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)

4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations; systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

State Governments

1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)

2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)

3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management

4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)

5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

Government of India

1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)

KEY FINDINGS

- Improvement in per-capita capital expenditure, on average in the last three years
- Audited annual financial statements made available online. Only 12/23 cities have made it available online
- Improved performance on AMRUT reforms such as appointment of internal auditor, credit rating and publishing of e-newsletter
- Action taken report on state finance commission recommendations made available online. Only 10/23 cities have made it available online

CITY FACTOID

Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Ahmedabad v/s Mumbai **

In practice, the municipal body in Ahmedabad handles only 10 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Ahmedabad is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 2.5 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 46.20% compared to 66.60% in state elections.

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the ‘City-Systems’ framework used for ASICS evaluation

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita
TOP INDIAN CITY
Pune | Score: 5.1

**KEY FINDINGS**

- Lack of city sanitation plan, comprehensive mobility plan and resilience strategy
- Not undertaken AMRUT reforms on double entry accounting system, credit rating, publishing e-newsletters and availability of a demand collection book
- Civic data not made available in open data format
- Lack of autonomy for Bruhat Bengaluru Mahanagara Palike in budget approval process

**CITY FACTOIDS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Bengaluru v/s Mumbai **</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the ‘City-Systems’ framework used for ASICS evaluation

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita

In practice, the municipal body in Bengaluru handles only 10 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Bengaluru is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 1 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 45.00% compared to 58.30% in state elections.

**KEY REFORMS**

**City Council**

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)

2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)

3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)

4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

**State Governments**

1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)

2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)

3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management

4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)

5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

**Government of India**

1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)
BHOPAL

SCORE  RANK
3.7 / 10  15 / 23

No change from 2016

TOP INDIAN CITY
Pune | Score: 5.1

KEY FINDINGS

- Absence of a metropolitan planning committee
- Lack of city resilience strategy and a land titling law
- Not undertaken AMRUT reforms on providing internship opportunity and publishing demand collection book
- Lack of autonomy for Bhopal Municipal Corporation in budget approval process

CITY FACTOIDS

Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Bhopal v/s Mumbai **

In practice, the municipal body in Bhopal handles only 9 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Bhopal is directly elected by its citizens and has a 5 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 56.70% compared to 63.90% in state elections.

KEY REFORMS

City Council
1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)
2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)
3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)
4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

State Governments
1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)
2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)
3. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)
4. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

Government of India
1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the ‘City-Systems’ framework used for ASICS evaluation

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita
BHUBANESWAR

SCORE 4.6/10   RANK 4/23

▲ 1.1 increase from 2016

TOP INDIAN CITY
Pune | Score: 5.1

KEY FINDINGS

- Policy in place for incentivising green buildings. Only 11/23 cities have provided such incentives
- Internal audit report made available online. Only 6/23 cities have made it available online
- Municipal staffing data made available online. Only 3/23 cities have made such information available online
- Action taken report on state finance commission recommendations made available online. Only 10/23 cities have made it available online

CITY FACTOIDS

Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Bhubaneswar v/s Mumbai **

In practice, the municipal body in Bhubaneswar handles only 9 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Bhubaneswar is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 5 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 43.30% compared to 43.10% in state elections.

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the 'City-Systems' framework used for ASICS evaluation

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita
CHANDIGARH

SCORE  RANK
3.1/10  22/23

▲ 1 increase from 2016

TOP INDIAN CITY
Pune | Score: 5.1

KEY FINDINGS

• Lack of city sanitation plan and land titling law
• Decline in own revenue generation, on average in the last three years
• Not undertaken AMRUT reforms on providing internship opportunities, credit rating and publishing e-newsletters and demand collection book
• Lack of autonomy for Chandigarh Municipal Corporation in budget approval process

CITY FACTOIDS

 Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Chandigarh v/s Mumbai **

In practice, the municipal body in Chandigarh handles only 9 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Chandigarh is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 1 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 59.50% compared to 78.10% in general elections.

KEY REFORMS

City Council
1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)
2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)
3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)
4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

State Governments
1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)
2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)
3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management
4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)
5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

Government of India
1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the ‘City-Systems’ framework used for ASICS evaluation

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita
**City Council**

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD).

2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR).

3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR).

4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP).

**State Governments**

1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD).

2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR).

3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management (ELPR).

4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR).

5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP).

**Government of India**

1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR).

---

**KEY REFORMS**

- **City Council**
  - Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD).
  - Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR).
  - Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR).
  - Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP).

- **State Governments**
  - Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD).
  - Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR).
  - Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management (ELPR).
  - Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR).
  - Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP).

- **Government of India**
  - Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR).

---

**OWN REVENUE PROPORTION TO TOTAL EXPENDITURE % AND CAPEX PER CAPITA – CHENNAI VS MUMBAI**

- **Lack of city sanitation plan, resilience strategy and land titling law**
- **Decline in own revenue generation, on average in last three years**
- **No municipal elections held since 2011**
- **Not undertaken AMRUT reforms on publishing e-newsletters and demand collection book**

---

**CITY FACTOIDS**

- **In practice, the municipal body in Chennai handles only 8 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).**

- **The mayor of Chennai is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 5 year term.**

---

**Annual Survey of India’s City-Systems (ASICS) 2017**

**CHENNAI**

**SCORE** 3.3/10

**RANK** 19/23

- **0.3 decrease from 2016**

**TOP INDIAN CITY**

Pune | Score: 5.1

---

**UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the 'City-Systems' framework used for ASICS evaluation.**

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita.**
City Factoids

**TOP INDIAN CITY**

**Pune | Score: 5.1**

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the ‘City-Systems’ framework used for ASICS evaluation*

**No change from 2016**

**City Council**

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)

2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)

3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)

4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

**State Governments**

1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)

2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)

3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management

4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)

5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

**Government of India**

1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCORE</th>
<th>RANK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1/10</td>
<td>21/23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In practice, the municipal body in Dehradun handles only 7 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Dehradun is directly elected by its citizens and has a 5 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 54.50% compared to 58.00% in state elections.

**KEY FINDINGS**

- Lack of resilience strategy and comprehensive mobility plan
- Decline in own revenue generation, on average in last three years
- Not undertaken AMRUT reforms on publishing e-newsletters and demand collection book, credit rating, appointment of internal auditors and providing internship opportunities
- Audited annual financial statements made available online. Only 12/23 cities have made it available online

**CITY FACTOIDS**

![Graph showing Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Dehradun vs Mumbai](image)

**Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Dehradun vs Mumbai**

- In 2013-14, Dehradun's own revenue proportion to total expenditure was 2.4% compared to Mumbai's 3.3%.
- In 2014-15, Dehradun's own revenue proportion to total expenditure was 2.9% compared to Mumbai's 3.3%.
- In 2015-16, Dehradun's own revenue proportion to total expenditure was 2.4% compared to Mumbai's 3.3%.

Further analysis:

- **Lack of resilience strategy and comprehensive mobility plan**
- **Decline in own revenue generation, on average in last three years**
- **Not undertaken AMRUT reforms on publishing e-newsletters and demand collection book, credit rating, appointment of internal auditors and providing internship opportunities**
- **Audited annual financial statements made available online. Only 12/23 cities have made it available online**

*Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita

**No change from 2016**
Top Indian City

Pune | Score: 5.1

**KEY FINDINGS**

- Metropolitan Planning Committee constituted (MPC). Only 9/18 cities that are mandated by law to form an MPC have actually constituted it.
- Policy in place for incentivising green buildings. Only 11/23 cities have provided such incentives.
- Undertaken AMRUT reforms on appointment of internal auditor, credit rating and publishing e-newsletters.
- Action taken report on state finance commission recommendations made available online. Only 10/23 cities have made it available online.

**CITY FACTOIDS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Own revenue proportion to total expenditure %</th>
<th>Capital expenditure per capita (in Rs)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>9,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>8,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In practice, the municipal body in Delhi handles only 9 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Delhi is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 1 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 53.60% compared to 67.50% in state elections.

---

**KEY REFORMS**

**City Council**

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD).
2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR).
3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR).
4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP).

**State Governments**

1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the Planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD).
2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR).
3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management (ELPR).
4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR).
5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP).

**Government of India**

1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR).

---


**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita.**
**City Factoids**

**Top Indian City**

Pune | Score: 5.1

**Key Findings**

- No effective system to deter plan violations
- Average budget variance of 57.6%, over the last three years
- Action taken report on state finance commission recommendations made available online. Only 10/23 cities have made it available online
- Civic data not made available in open data format

**City Council**

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)
2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)
3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)
4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

**State Governments**

1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)
2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)
3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management
4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)
5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

**Government of India**

1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)

---

**Key Reforms**

- **City Council**
  1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)
  2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)
  3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)
  4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

- **State Governments**
  1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)
  2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)
  3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management
  4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)
  5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

- **Government of India**
  1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)

---

**City-Systems Score**

- **UPD**: Urban Planning & Design
- **UCR**: Urban Capacities & Resources
- **ELPR**: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation
- **TAP**: Transparency, Accountability & Participation

**Score**: 3.8/10  
**Rank**: 14/23

---

**Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Guwahati v/s Mumbai**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Guwahati Capex per capita (in Rs)</th>
<th>Guwahati Own revenue to total expenditure %</th>
<th>Mumbai Capex per capita (in Rs)</th>
<th>Mumbai Own revenue to total expenditure %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>9,000</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>8,000</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>9,500</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>7,000</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>9,000</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

- **In practice**, the municipal body in Guwahati handles only **8 functions** as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).
- **The mayor of Guwahati** is **indirectly elected** by its citizens and has a **5 year term**.
- **Voter turnout in last municipal elections** is **56.20%** compared to **79.40%** in state elections.

---

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the ‘City-Systems’ framework used for ASICS evaluation

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita**
**City Factoids**

- Improvement in per-capita capital expenditure, on average in the last three years
- Detailed information on schemes and services of GHMC made available online. Only 9/23 cities have made such information online
- Audited annual financial statements made available online. Only 12/23 cities have made it available online
- Undertaken AMRUT reforms on appointment of internal auditor, credit rating and publishing e-newsletters

**Key Findings**

1. Improvement in per-capita capital expenditure, on average in the last three years
2. Detailed information on schemes and services of GHMC made available online. Only 9/23 cities have made such information online
3. Audited annual financial statements made available online. Only 12/23 cities have made it available online
4. Undertaken AMRUT reforms on appointment of internal auditor, credit rating and publishing e-newsletters

**City-Systems Score**

- **4.3/10**
- **8/23**
- **0.3 increase from 2016**

**Top Indian City**

Pune | Score: 5.1

---

### Key Reforms

1. **City Council**
   - Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)
2. **Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions** to enable the same (UCR)
3. **Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan**, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)
4. **Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations**, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

### State Governments

1. **Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics** and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)
2. **Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year** (UCR)
3. **Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules** to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management
4. **Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances** (ELPR)
5. **Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit** (TAP)

### Government of India

1. **Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments** (ELPR)

---

**HYDERABAD**

**Score**

- **4.3/10**
- **8/23**

**Increase from 2016**

- **0.3**

**Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Hyderabad v/s Mumbai**

- In practice, the municipal body in Hyderabad handles only 10 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).
- The mayor of Hyderabad is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 5 year term.
- Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 45.00% compared to 52.70% in state elections.

---

**Notes:**

- UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the City-Systems framework used for ASICS evaluation
- Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita
**KEY REFORMS**

**City Council**

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)

2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)

3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)

4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

**State Governments**

1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIe) (UPD)

2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)

3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management (ELPR)

4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)

5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

**Government of India**

1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)

---

**TOP INDIAN CITY
Pune | Score: 5.1**

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita**

---

**KEY FINDINGS**

- Improvement in per-capita capital expenditure, on average in the last three years
- Live e-procurement system made available on Kanpur Municipal Corporation website. Only 15/23 cities have made it available in the ULB website
- Undertaken AMRUT reforms on appointment of internal auditor, credit rating and publishing e-newsletters
- Action taken report on state finance commission recommendations made available online. Only 10/23 cities have made it available online

---

**CITY FACTOIDS**

**Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Jaipur v/s Mumbai**

- **City-Systems Score**
  - **Score:** 3.4/10
  - **Rank:** 18/23
  - **0.7 increase** from 2016

- **JAIPUR**
  - **In practice, the municipal body in Jaipur handles only 7 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).**
  - **The mayor of Jaipur is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 5 year term.**
  - **Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 56.00% compared to 72.80% in state elections.**

---

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the ‘City-Systems’ framework used for ASICS evaluation

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita**
KANPUR

SCORE  RANK
3.9/10  12/23

▲ 0.2 increase from 2016

TOP INDIAN CITY
Pune | Score: 5.1

KEY FINDINGS

- Improvement in per-capita capital expenditure, on average in the last three years
- Live e-procurement system made available on Kanpur Municipal Corporation website. Only 15/23 cities have made it available in the ULB website
- Undertaken AMRUT reforms on appointment of internal auditor, credit rating and publishing e-newsletters
- Internal audit report made available online. Only 6/23 cities have made it available online

CITY FACTOIDS

Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Kanpur v/s Mumbai **

In practice, the municipal body in Kanpur handles only 7 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Kanpur is directly elected by its citizens and has a 5 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 41.10% compared to 55.00% in state elections.

KEY REFORMS

City Council
1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)
2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)
3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)
4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

State Governments
1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)
2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)
3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management
4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)
5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

Government of India
1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the 'City-Systems' framework used for ASICS evaluation

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita.
**City Factoids**

- **TOP INDIAN CITY**
  - Pune | Score: 5.1

**Key Reforms**

1. **City Council**
   - Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)

2. **Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies,** explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)

3. **Create a medium-term workforce plan** and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)

4. **Adopt open data standards,** usher in radical transparency in finances and operations; systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

**State Governments**

1. **Overhaul planning acts,** mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)

2. **Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation,** mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)

3. **Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules** to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management

4. **Overhaul municipal corporation acts** to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)

5. **Enact community participation law and public disclosure law.** Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

**Government of India**

1. **Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm,** evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)

---

**Key Findings**

- Improvement in per-capita capital expenditure, on average in the last three years
- Adherence to budget timelines as mandated by law. Only 9/23 cities truly adhere to such mandates
- Live e-procurement system made available on Kolkata Municipal Corporation website. Only 15/23 cities have made it available in the ULB website
- Audited annual financial statements made available online. Only 12/23 cities have made it available online

**City-Systems Score**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.6/10</td>
<td>2/23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**0.5 increase from 2016**

**Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Kolkata v/s Mumbai**

- **In practice,** the municipal body in Kolkata handles only **10 functions** as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).
- The mayor of Kolkata is **indirectly elected** by its citizens and has a **5 year term**.
- **Voter turnout** in last municipal elections is **68.60%** compared to **68.50%** in state elections.

**Capital expenditure per capita (in Rs)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2013-14</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6,3</td>
<td>6,3</td>
<td>6,3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**KOLKATA**

**Annual Survey of India’s City-Systems (ASICS) 2017**
LUCKNOW

SCORE     RANK
3.8/10    13/23
▲ 0.5 increase from 2016

TOP INDIAN CITY
Pune | Score: 5.1

KEY FINDINGS

- Improvement in per-capita capital expenditure, on average in the last three years
- Audited annual financial statements made available online. Only 12/23 cities have made it available online
- Undertaken AMRUT reforms on appointment of internal auditor, credit rating and publishing e-newsletters
- Internal audit report made available online. Only 6/23 cities have made it available online

CITY FACTOIDS

Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Lucknow v/s Mumbai

In practice, the municipal body in Lucknow handles only 7 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Lucknow is directly elected by its citizens and has a 5 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 47.00% compared to 56.60% in state elections.

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the ‘City-Systems’ framework used for ASICS evaluation

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita

KEY REFORMS

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)
2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)
3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)
4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

State Governments

1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)
2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)
3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management
4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)
5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

Government of India

1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)
City Factoids

Key Findings

Top Indian City
Pune | Score: 5.1

City Council

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)

2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)

3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)

4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

State Governments

1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)

2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)

3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management (ELPR)

4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)

5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

Government of India

1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)

Key Reforms

City Systems Score*

16/23

Score: 5.1


Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita.

In practice, the municipal body in Ludhiana handles only 8 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Ludhiana is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 1 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 63.30% compared to 70.50% in state elections.


**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita.
**MUMBAI**

**SCORE** 4.2 / 10  
**RANK** 9 / 23  
▲ 0.1 increase from 2016

**TOP INDIAN CITY**  
Pune | Score: 5.1

**KEY FINDINGS**

- Decline in per-capita capital expenditure, on average in the last three years
- Not undertaken AMRUT reforms on publishing e-newsletters and demand collection book, credit rating and providing internship opportunities
- Action taken report on State Finance Commission recommendations not made available online
- No comprehensive mobility plan for the city

**CITY FACTOIDS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Mumbai v/s Pune **</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Capital expenditure per capita (in Rs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013 - 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- In practice, the municipal body in Mumbai handles only 14 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).
- The mayor of Mumbai is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 2.5 year term.
- Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 55.30% compared to 50.80% in state elections.

**KEY REFORMS**

1. **City Council**
   - Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)
   - Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)

2. **State Governments**
   - Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)
   - Overhaul planning acts, mandates creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)
   - Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

3. **Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)**

4. **Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)**

5. **Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules** to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management

6. **Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)**

7. **Enact community participation law and public disclosure law**. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

8. **Government of India**
   - Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)
**TOP INDIAN CITY**
Pune | Score: 5.1

**City Council**
1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD).
2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR).
3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR).
4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP).

**State Governments**
1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD).
2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR).
3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management (ELPR).
4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR).
5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP).

**Government of India**
1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR).

---

**Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Patna v/s Mumbai**

- Not undertaken AMRUT reforms on double entry accounting system, providing internship opportunity, credit rating, publishing e-newsletters and demand collection book.
- No land titling law and land pooling policy.
- City sanitation plan and comprehensive mobility plan not made available online.
- Action taken report on State Finance Commission recommendations not made available online.

---

**Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 46.00% compared to 43.60% in state elections.**

---

**In practice, the municipal body in Patna handles only 6 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).**

---

**The mayor of Patna is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 5 year term.**

---

**City Factoids**

- Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Patna v/s Mumbai.

---

**Key findings**

- Top Indian City
- Pune | Score: 5.1

---

**Key reforms**

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD).
2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR).
3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR).
4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP).

---

**Score**

- 3.3/10
- Rank: 20/23
- ▼ 0.1 decrease from 2016
KEY REFORMS

City Council
1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD).
2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR).
3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR).
4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP).

State Governments
1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD).
2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR).
3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management.
4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR).
5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP).

Government of India
1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR).

KEY FINDINGS

- Undertaken AMRUT reforms on appointment of internal auditor, credit rating, providing internship opportunities and publishing e-newsletters.
- Improvement in own revenue to total expenditure and per-capita capital expenditure, on average over the last three years.
- Municipal staffing data made available online. Only 3/23 cities have made such information available online.
- Digital governance roadmap made available online. Only 2/23 cities have made such information available online.

CITY FACTOIDS

- Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Pune vs Mumbai **

In practice, the municipal body in Pune handles only 14 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Pune is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 2.5 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 53.60% compared to 55.70% in state elections.


**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita.
**RAIPUR**

**SCORE** 4 / 10
**RANK** 11 / 23

▲ 0.7 increase from 2016

**TOP INDIAN CITY**
Pune | Score: 5.1

**KEY FINDINGS**

- Improvement in per-capita capital expenditure, on average in the last three years
- Audited annual financial statements made available online. Only 12/23 cities have made it available online
- Internal audit report made available online. Only 6/23 cities have made it available online
- Live e-procurement system made available on Raipur Municipal Corporation website. Only 15/23 cities have made it available in the ULB website

**CITY FACTOIDS**

![Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Raipur v/s Mumbai **](image)

In practice, the municipal body in Raipur handles only 9 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Raipur is directly elected by its citizens and has a 5 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 58.10% compared to 65.20% in state elections.

**KEY REFORMS**

1. **City Council**
   - Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)
   - Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)

2. **State Governments**
   - Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)
   - Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)

3. **Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

4. **Government of India**
   - Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)
   - Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

---


**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita.**
**City Factoids**

- **Ranchi** v/s **Mumbai**
  - **Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita**
  - **2013 - 14**
    - Ranchi: 8,500
    - Mumbai: 14,000
  - **2014 - 15**
    - Ranchi: 9,000
    - Mumbai: 15,500
  - **2015 - 16**
    - Ranchi: 9,500
    - Mumbai: 17,000

- In practice, the municipal body in Ranchi handles only **8 functions** as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).
- The mayor of Ranchi is **directly elected** by its citizens and has a **5 year term**.
- Voter turnout in last municipal elections is **38.00%** compared to **53.40%** in state elections.

**Key Findings**

- Undertaken AMRUT reforms on appointment of internal auditor, credit rating, providing internship opportunities, publishing e-newsletters and demand collection book
- Improvement in per-capita capital expenditure, on average in the last three years
  - Internal audit report made available online. Only 6/23 cities have made it available online
- Live e-procurement system made available on Ranchi Municipal Corporation website. Only 15/23 cities have made it available in the ULB website

**City Council**

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)

2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)

3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)

4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

**State Governments**

1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)

2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)

3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management (ELPR)

4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)

**Government of India**

1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)
**City Factoids**

RANK

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCORE</th>
<th>RANK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.5/10</td>
<td>5/23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOP INDIAN CITY**
Pune | Score: 5.1

**Key findings**

1. Undertaken AMRUT reforms on appointment of internal auditor, credit rating, providing internship opportunities and publishing e-newsletters
2. Improvement in own revenue and per-capita capital expenditure, on average over the last three years
3. Significant autonomy over municipal budget
4. Action taken report on state finance commission recommendations made available online. Only 10/23 cities have made it available online

**Key Reforms**

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)
2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)
3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)
4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

**State Governments**

1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)
2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)
3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management
4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)
5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

**Government of India**

1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)

---

**In practice, the municipal body in Surat handles only 9 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).**

**The mayor of Surat is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 2.5 year term.**

**Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 39.60% compared to 66.80% in state elections.**

---

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the ‘City-Systems’ framework used for ASICS evaluation

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita.**
**THIRUVANANTHAPURAM**

**SCORE**  4.6/10  **RANK**  3/23

▲ 0.2 increase from 2016

**TOP INDIAN CITY**
Pune  | Score: 5.1

**KEY FINDINGS**

- Improvement in own revenue on average over the last three years
- Adherence to budget timelines as mandated by law. Only 9/23 cities truly adhere to such mandates
- Action taken report on state finance commission recommendations made available online. Only 10/23 cities have made it available online
- Undertaken AMRUT reforms on credit rating, implementing double entry accrual system and publishing e-newsletters

**CITY FACTOIDS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Own revenue proportion to total expenditure % and capex per capita – Thiruvananthapuram v/s Mumbai **</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capital expenditure per capita (in Rs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Own revenue to total expenditure %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In practice, the municipal body in Thiruvananthapuram handles only 9 functions as opposed to the 18 listed in the 74th Constitution Amendment Act (CAA).

The mayor of Thiruvananthapuram is indirectly elected by its citizens and has a 5 year term.

Voter turnout in last municipal elections is 62.90% compared to 70.80% in state elections.

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the ‘City-Systems’ framework used for ASICS evaluation

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita

**KEY REFORMS**

1. **City Council**
   - Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)

2. **Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)**

3. **Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)**

4. **Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)**

5. **State Governments**
   - Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)

6. **Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)**

7. **Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management (ELPR)**

8. **Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)**

9. **Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)**

10. **Government of India**
    - Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)**
**City Factoids**

- Municipal elections not held since 2007
- Budget variance of 38%, on average, over the last three years
- Civic data not available in open data format
- Fares poorly on empowered mayor and council

**Key Findings**

- Visakhapatnam v/s Mumbai

---

**City Council**

1. Implement an effective system to monitor, report and penalise Spatial Development Plan (SDP) violations (UPD)

2. Sharply focus on improving collection efficiencies, explore technology and outsourcing solutions to enable the same (UCR)

3. Create a medium-term workforce plan and an annual workforce plan, aligned to medium-term fiscal plan and annual budgets (UCR)

4. Adopt open data standards, usher in radical transparency in finances and operations, systematically provide actionable data at a neighborhood level (TAP)

**State Governments**

1. Overhaul planning acts, mandate creation of three levels of SDPs with defined objectives and metrics and covering the planning Preparation, Implementation & Enforcement (PIE) (UPD)

2. Enact Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management (FRBM) Act legislation, mandate audit of annual accounts by CAs by 31 July each year (UCR)

3. Overhaul cadre and recruitment rules to bring them up to modern, contemporary standards of HR management

4. Overhaul municipal corporation acts to empower the empowered mayor and ensure critical functions are meaningfully devolved, and mayors and councils have full powers over staffing and finances (ELPR)

5. Enact community participation law and public disclosure law. Notify rules and implement them in spirit (TAP)

**Government of India**

1. Lead the effort on a metropolitan governance paradigm, evolve consensus with state governments (ELPR)

---

*UPD: Urban Planning & Design, UCR: Urban Capacities & Resources, ELPR: Empowered & Legitimate Political Representation and TAP: Transparency, Accountability & Participation are the four components of the ‘City-Systems’ framework used for ASICS evaluation

**Mumbai has been chosen as the benchmark city since it has the highest capex per capita**